

Packages - Packaging Request #2164

[iceweasel][iceweasel-addons] Provide /usr/lib/firefox symlink to drop iceweasel-specific extensions in favor of ones from Arch

2019-02-03 11:09 AM - grizzlyuser

Status: open	% Done: 50%
Priority: discussion	
Assignee:	
Category:	
Description AFAIK, the only differences between Iceweasel-specific extensions from Parabola repos and Firefox-specific ones from Arch repos are: 1. Install path (/usr/lib/iceweasel/ and /usr/lib/firefox/ respectively) 2. Package/group names and replaces/conflicts in PKGBUILDS. I'm not sure about how critical it is to have 'iceweasel-*' named extensions (like iceweasel-ublock-origin instead of firefox-ublock-origin from Arch). If that's not critical, then what about just providing symlink from /usr/lib/iceweasel/ to /usr/lib/firefox/ in iceweasel package? That would allow to drop iceweasel-ublock-origin and iceweasel-noscript from [libre] (and probably others I don't know about) and use versions from Arch, which look likely to be updated more frequently.	
Subtasks:	
Packaging Request # 1873: [firefox-extension-privacybadger] Requires blacklisted firefox	fixed
Packaging Request # 1899: HTTPS Everywhere	fixed
Packaging Request # 3253: Privacy Badger	open
Packaging Request # 3254: Decentraleyes	open
Related issues:	
Related to Packages - Freedom Issue #2718: [firefox-i18n-tl] Iceweasel langua...	unconfirmed

History

#1 - 2019-02-03 11:27 AM - bill-auger

there is only 'iceweasel-noscript' and 'iceweasel-ublock-origin', both in the 'iceweasel-addons' package group

the arch firefox-ublock-origin package is installable as is many others - i dont know if they should be installable nor if they actually work

```
$ sudo pacman -S firefox-addons
:: There are 9 members in group firefox-addons:
:: Repository community
   1) firefox-dark-reader  2) firefox-decentraleyes  3) firefox-extension-privacybadger
   4) firefox-referer-control  5) firefox-stylus  6) firefox-tree-style-tab  7) firefox-tridactyl
   8) firefox-ublock-origin  9) firefox-umatrix
```

```
Enter a selection (default=all):
resolving dependencies...
warning: cannot resolve "firefox", a dependency of "firefox-extension-privacybadger"
:: The following package cannot be upgraded due to unresolvable dependencies:
   firefox-extension-privacybadger
```

```
:: Do you want to skip the above package for this upgrade? [y/N] y
looking for conflicting packages...
```

```
Packages (8) firefox-dark-reader-4.7.5-1  firefox-decentraleyes-2.0.8-2  firefox-referer-control-1.31-2
             firefox-stylus-1.5.2-2  firefox-tree-style-tab-2.7.18-1  firefox-tridactyl-1.14.8-1
             firefox-ublock-origin-1.18.2-1  firefox-umatrix-1.3.16-1
```

```
Total Download Size: 13.72 MiB
Total Installed Size: 15.27 MiB
```

apparently, 'iceweasel' does not provide 'firefox' - though i cant imagine why not - i assumed that was standard procedure for packages in [libre] that may have dependencies under the original blacklisted package name

these are the only arch addons that are on the blacklist:

```
firefox-adblock-plus
firefox-extension-https-everywhere
```

```
firefox-noscript
firefox-spell-ru
```

of note, is that 'firefox-noscript' does not have a replacement package specified in the blacklist, though a replacement package was made and published

#2 - 2019-02-03 12:33 PM - grizzlyuser

Oops, it looks like simple symlink won't work. I tried to:

```
# ln -s /usr/lib/iceweasel/ /usr/lib/firefox
```

and then on installing of firefox-ublock-origin, pacman complains:

```
error: failed to commit transaction (conflicting files)
firefox-ublock-origin: /usr/lib/firefox exists in filesystem
Errors occurred, no packages were upgraded.
```

I'm definitely not a packaging guru, so not sure how that can be solved the best way.

bill-auger wrote:

the arch firefox-ublock-origin package is installable as is many others - i dont know if they should be installable nor if they actually work

I tried to install just firefox-ublock-origin, and it doesn't work right away. However, if before clean installation I do:

```
# mkdir /usr/lib/firefox
# mount --bind /usr/lib/iceweasel/ /usr/lib/firefox
```

Then the extension is installed with no problems and works as expected.

#3 - 2019-02-03 07:08 PM - eschwartz

You cannot package a **file** /usr/lib/firefox, with the intent of having packages that provide /usr/lib/firefox/browser/extensions/* get redirected to install somewhere else. That's not how pacman works.

You could, however, package a symlink as /usr/lib/iceweasel/browser/extensions and have all extensions get installed in /usr/lib/firefox/browser/extensions/* while having iceweasel pick them up. pacman will be fine with that.

Alternatively, it's quite silly to provide packages which cannot be installed/make no sense due to firefox being blacklisted. https-everywhere and adblock-plus have been blacklisted for ages, and noscript has been forked to an iceweasel version -- I assume privacybadger was an oversight and all the rest are recent additions so were almost certainly oversights, none of them make sense in the parabola repositories as-is.

#4 - 2019-02-04 02:26 AM - bill-auger

ok so i think the only thing left to determine here is

- is it possible or desirable to make iceweasel truly provide a firefox implementation
 - if so, then we need to check the licensing on all the new firefox-* addons and possibly blacklist some
 - if not, then we need do no more that simply blacklist and/or re-package the new firefox-* addons

IMHO the only thing about this in the "pros" list is that we would gain those extra 7 addons (and depending on their licenses, it could be fewer than that) - but these are not complicated programs, we could just repackage them - the OPs argument on the "cons" is that we dont upgrade them fast enough; but that is not a systematic flaw, so that could (should) be improved regardless of what becomes of this issue

#5 - 2019-02-06 06:35 AM - bill-auger

ive added the new addons to the blacklist for now

#6 - 2019-07-21 03:48 PM - bill-auger

- Related to Packaging Request #1899: HTTPS Everywhere added

#7 - 2019-07-21 03:50 PM - bill-auger

- Related to Packaging Request #1873: [firefox-extension-privacybadger] Requires blacklisted firefox added

#8 - 2019-07-21 03:52 PM - bill-auger

or .. we should re-package the others and add them to the 'iceweasel-addons' group - this is the current list of firefox add-ons that we are suppressing without replacements, probably all merely for depending on 'firefox'

firefox-adblock-plus
 firefox-dark-reader
 firefox-decentraleyes
 firefox-extension-privacybadger
 firefox-referer-control
 firefox-spell-ru
 firefox-stylus
 firefox-tree-style-tab
 firefox-tridactyl

#9 - 2019-07-21 04:26 PM - bill-auger

- Priority changed from bug to wish

- Subject changed from [iceweasel] Provide /usr/lib/firefox symlink to drop iceweasel-specific extensions in favor of ones from Arch to [iceweasel][iceweasel-addons] Provide /usr/lib/firefox symlink to drop iceweasel-specific extensions in favor of ones from Arch

#10 - 2019-07-21 04:27 PM - bill-auger

- Priority changed from wish to discussion

#11 - 2019-07-23 07:57 PM - theova

It is and will not be difficult to adapt Arch's PKGBUILDS, but this means additional work to do and more packages to maintain/update. In my opinion it is - apart from one word - not a big gain to create libre replacements. I would therefore vote for the symlink.

Anyway, I would like to contribute to this issue - either by creating libre replacements and/or a license audit. Just let me know, which solution is favoured.

#12 - 2019-08-01 10:56 AM - theova

The following addons have a free license:

Name	License	Source	Note
firefox-adblock-plus	GPLv3	project website Source Code FSD	ublock-origin may be better in terms of privacy
browserpass-firefox	ISC License	Project Repository	
firefox-dark-reader	MIT	Project repository	
firefox-decentraleyes	Mozilla Public License Version 2.0	Project repository	
firefox-https-everywhere	Licensed GPL v2+, AGPLv3+	Project repository	included in icecat per default
firefox-noscript	GPLv2+	FAQ , Project Repository	
firefox-extension-privacybadger	GPLv3, MIT, Unlicense, Open Font License, Apache License v2	Project repository Project website	
firefox-spell-ru	GPL ??	Arch PKGBUILD	Not sure about the license. Could not find any source or repository
firefox-stylus	GPLv3	Project repository	
firefox-tree-style-tab	MPL 2.0, MPL 1.1, MIT, PSFL	Project repository	
firefox-tridactyl	Apache 2.0	Project repository	

For firefox-spell-ru I am really not sure, since I could not find a license. I think, `spell-ru` is part of Mozillas "Dictionaries and Language Packs" which can be found [here](#).

The following addon should definitely not be included:

Name	License	Source	Note
firefox-referer-control	MPL v2.0 ??	Firefox Addons	Removed from Arch's [Community]

#13 - 2019-09-03 05:18 PM - bill-auger

awesome research theova - thanks

#14 - 2019-10-14 10:27 PM - dllud

Nice to see all this already documented here. Right now I am in need of the tridactyl package because the addon [isn't getting updates through AMO](#). Have you taken a decision on the way forward? If the choice is to adapt Arch PKGBUILDS and provide alternatives in [libre] I can bootstrap that for this simple package.

#15 - 2019-10-14 10:57 PM - bill-auger

the idea is to make iceweasel able to use the existing arch packages so that we would not need to re-package them - you could probably get iceweasel to use the 'tridactyl' arch package now, by adding the symlink yourself - that is one example of a package that is on the blacklist and would need to be re-packaged only for the trivial reason that it gets installed in a directory named 'firefox' rather than 'iceweasel' - that any many others would probably "just work" if that symlink were in place - if you'd like to try, let us know if it worked

```
$ sudo mkdir -p /usr/lib/iceweasel/browser/extensions/  
$ sudo ln -s /usr/lib/{firefox,iceweasel}/browser/extensions/tridactyl.vim@cmcaine.co.uk.xpi  
$ sudo pacman -U https://www.archlinux.org/packages/community/any/firefox-tridactyl/download/
```

#16 - 2020-05-05 05:29 AM - bill-auger

- Related to Freedom Issue #2718: *[firefox-i18n-tl] iceweasel language packs already exists (and it would cause conflicts) added*

#17 - 2022-04-24 02:00 AM - gap

I think the preferred solution should be to make new packages in the libre repo, rename firefox-* to iceweasel-*, and change the install locations. A simple symlink would preserve the Firefox name, which I think violates the GNU FSDG as it could be considered recommending a package which is nightmarish in terms of freedom, privacy, and security.

The liberation changes would be relatively minimal, but a maintenance burden nonetheless.

#18 - 2022-04-24 02:08 AM - bill-auger

there is no conflict with the FSDG for merely mentioning a non-free project name - it is not a recommendation to use firefox; because parabola users can not install firefox - also, and most importantly, firefox is not non-free ; and the FSDG does not require distros to protect anyone's privacy or security - firefox is blacklisted because of its "anti-features" - whether or not some of those are privacy or security concerns is not the issue

thanks for pointing me in this direction though - i think it is time to move on this - like many of the other issues you have revisited lately; they were discussed, but never decided, so nothing was done - if no one else objects soon, i will probably go forward with this proposal

#19 - 2022-04-24 02:08 AM - bill-auger

just as an update: there are now three packages in the 'iceweasel-addons' group

```
$ pacman -Sg iceweasel-addons  
iceweasel-addons iceweasel-https-everywhere  
iceweasel-addons iceweasel-noscript  
iceweasel-addons iceweasel-ublock-origin
```

and to add that if this proposal is decided, it would also allow all language packages to be removed from the blacklist - we have not packaged replacements for those language packs in a while - they are not actually needed anymore; because iceweasel offers them via its prefs GUI - still it is always good to reduce the blacklist

FWIW, the blacklisting history is spotty for most all of these - for example, even while the lang-packs were replaced, the blacklist did not reference the replacements - i referenced this ticket for all add-ons and language packs, which did not already have a BR reference

#20 - 2022-04-25 09:21 AM - gap

Firefox packages in the repos:
- firefox-clearurls
- firefox-extension-mailvelope
- firefox-temporary-containers

[bill-auger](#)

I also noticed you removed firefox-stylus from the blacklist. Is this because it is no longer in the Arch/Arch32/ArchARM/Artix repos or did you go ahead and decide to bring it back regardless of the "Firefox" name?

#21 - 2022-04-25 10:30 AM - bill-auger

firefox-stylus is not an arch package anymore; so there is no reason for it to be on the blacklist

#22 - 2022-06-30 12:21 AM - gap

The following Firefox packages are still in the repos:
- i686/firefox-clearurls
- i686/firefox-stylus
- i686/firefox-temporary-containers
- firefox-i18n-sco
- firefox-i18n-szl