

Packages - Bug #3451

community/bass lacking source code

2023-03-08 11:19 PM - GNUtoo

Status:	fixed	% Done:	0%
Priority:	freedom issue		
Assignee:	bill-auger		
Category:			
Description			
The source code zip has the following files:			
<pre>bass-cd-1.2/sky.dnr bass-cd-1.2/sky.dsk bass-cd-1.2/readme.txt bass-cd-1.2/sky.cpt</pre>			
And the license is the following (from readme.txt):			
<pre>1) You may distribute this game for free on any medium, provided this readme and all associated copyright notices and disclaimers are left intact. 2) You may charge a reasonable copying fee for this archive, and may distribute it in aggregate as part of a larger & possibly commercial software distribution (such as a Linux distribution or magazine coverdisk). You must provide proper attribution and ensure this readme and all associated copyright notices, and disclaimers are left intact. 3) You may not charge a fee for the game itself. This includes reselling the game as an individual item. 4) You may modify the game as you wish. You may also distribute modified versions under the terms set forth in this license, but with the additional requirement that the work is marked with a prominent notice which states that it is a modified version. 5) All game content is (C) Revolution Software Ltd. The ScummVM engine is (C) The ScummVM Team (www.scummvm.org) 6) THE GAMEDATA IN THIS ARCHIVE IS PROVIDED "AS IS" AND WITHOUT ANY EXPRESS OR IMPLIED WARRANTIES, INCLUDING AND NOT LIMITED TO ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY AND FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE.</pre>			
The same readme.txt has:			
<pre>Some time ago, we (ScummVM) had the good fortune to come in contact with Tony Warriner at Revolution Software Ltd. With their blessing and support, we then obtained the original source code for Beneath a Steel Sky and added support for it to our adventure game interpreter, ScummVM. And now, on the eve of ScummVM 0.5.0 (the first release featuring B.A.S.S support), Revolution Software Ltd. has decided to release Sky to the public as freeware!</pre>			
So that is probably OK FSDG wise as this data could be considered as non-functionnal and that we get permissions to redistrbute it even commercially.			
However AFAIK Parabola has a free culture requirement, so even if we have the right to modify it, we might lack the information to do that (the source code).			
Though maybe some people have more information about the game format and all, so maybe I'm mistaken?			

History

#1 - 2023-03-09 08:25 AM - bill-auger

On Wed, 08 Mar 2023 23:19:57 +0000 labs@parabola.nu wrote:

3) You may not charge a fee for the game itself. This includes reselling the game as an individual item.

that is a non-free license, plain and simple

#2 - 2023-03-09 03:42 PM - GNUtoo

- Status changed from unconfirmed to confirmed

Ah indeed, for some reasons I didn't see that part. Since it's considered NC some other FSDG distros also have the issue (Guix, PureOS, Trisquel, maybe more).

Should we update the [https://libreplanet.org/wiki/List_of_software_that_does_not_respect_the_Free_System_Distribution_Guidelines List of software that does not respect the Free System Distribution Guidelines] with it as well and ask users to bugreport to other distros as well somehow?

Denis.

#3 - 2023-03-09 04:04 PM - GNUtoo

Here's the status of various distributions:

Distro	Package name	Status
Dragora	?	Doesn't seem to have scummvm
Dynebolic	?	unlikely to have it
Guix	* dracula * lure, lure-de, lure-es, lure-fr, lure-it * queen, queen-de, queen-fr, queen-it * sky	Bug # 62784
Hyperbola	None	Seems not to have it (I looked for sky, bass and beneath)
LibreCMC	Seems to lack scummvm	I've checked in packages/mips_24kc/{base,packages}
ProteanOS	?	unlikely to have it
Parabola	bass	Bug #3451 , removed from Parabola
PureOS	beneath-a-steel-sky, probably more	Need to bugreport or look if it's already bugreported
Replicant	Doesn't have it	Doesn't ship scummvm nor that game
Trisquel: * etiona * nabia * aramo	Source packages: * beneath-a-steel-sky * dracula * flight-of-the-amazon-queen * lure-of-the-temptress	bug # 66
Ututo S	?	?

Update 1: Added bug reports and mention that there is more than just beneath-a-steel-sky.

Update 2: bass has been removed from Parabola.

Denis.

#4 - 2023-06-27 01:32 AM - bill-auger

- Assignee set to bill-auger

- Status changed from confirmed to fixed

just to note, this discussion was taken to the FSDG mailing list - unfortunately, the discussion derailed onto the topic of the value of scummvm itself, and then onto the yet more general topic of all retro emulators and retro gaming; but the original issue of the "no-selling" license is still undecided¹

why? because the trisquel maintainer suggested that this is the same general case of the SIL OFL fonts license, which was previously determined to be acceptable² - then RMS suggested to review that decision - FWIW, those OFL fonts are fairly ubiquitous - the impact of over-turning that decision could be great

but anyways ... 'bass' is gone from parabola now; so i consider this ticket to be closed

[1]: <https://lists.nongnu.org/archive/html/gnu-linux-libre/2023-06/msg00077.html>

[2]: <https://lists.nongnu.org/archive/html/gnu-linux-libre/2023-06/msg00084.html>